

IS DEATH EVER PREFERABLE TO LIFE?

# INTERNATIONAL LIBRARY OF ETHICS, LAW, AND THE NEW MEDICINE

## *Founding Editors*

DAVID C. THOMASMA†

DAVID N. WEISSTUB, *Université de Montréal, Canada*

THOMASINE KIMBROUGH KUSHNER, *University of California, Berkeley, U.S.A.*

## *Editor*

DAVID N. WEISSTUB, *Université de Montréal, Canada*

## *Editorial Board*

SOLLY BENATAR, *University of Cape Town, South Africa*

JURRIT BERGSMA, *Rijksuniversiteit Utrecht, The Netherlands*

TERRY CARNEY, *University of Sydney, Australia*

UFFE JUUL JENSEN, *Universitet Aarhus, Denmark*

GERRIT K. KIMSMA, *Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam, The Netherlands*

EVERT VAN LEEUWEN, *Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam, The Netherlands*

DAVID NOVAK, *University of Toronto, Canada*

EDMUND D. PELLEGRINO, *Georgetown University, Washington D.C., U.S.A.*

DOM RENZO PEGORARO, *Fondazione Lanza and University of Padua, Italy*

ROBYN SHAPIRO, *Medical College of Wisconsin, Milwaukee, U.S.A.*

VOLUME 14

*The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.*

# **IS DEATH EVER PREFERABLE TO LIFE?**

*by*

**Ian N. Olver**

*University of Adelaide and Royal Adelaide Hospital Cancer Centre,  
Adelaide, Australia*



**SPRINGER-SCIENCE+BUSINESS MEDIA, B.V.**

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 978-90-481-6178-2      ISBN 978-94-017-1976-6 (eBook)  
DOI 10.1007/978-94-017-1976-6

---

*Printed on acid-free paper*

All Rights Reserved

© 2002 Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht

Originally published by Kluwer Academic Publishers in 2002

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

I dedicate this book to my wife Jenny and sons Scott, Chris and Robert whose loving support made it possible for me to accept the challenge of completing this project

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgement	xi
CHAPTER 1: IN THE BEGINNING	1
Defining Death	3
Regarding Life	4
The Relative Value of Life and Individual Autonomy	5
Slippery Slopes	5
Rationing Health Resources	6
CHAPTER 2: THE DEFINITION OF DEATH	8
Biological Approach to Death	10
<i>Heart-lung Death</i>	10
<i>Brain Death Criteria</i>	11
<i>Lower Brain Death</i>	12
<i>Upper Brain Death</i>	13
<i>Anencephaly</i>	15
A Hierarchy of Organ Deaths	16
<i>Personhood</i>	18
Application of the Hierarchy of Organ Deaths	22
Respect for Dead Bodies	25
CHAPTER 3: DEATH RELATIVE TO LIFE	28
The Value of Life	29
The Inability to Create Life	30
Comparing Life to Death	32
Death as Foreclosure of Life's Options	37
Acts and Omissions	47
The Principle of Double Effect	51
Ordinary and Extraordinary Means	56
Defending Life on Top of the Hierarchy of Values	58
CHAPTER 4: AUTONOMY AND LIFE OR DEATH DECISIONS	69
Ranking Autonomy and Quality of Life	69
Whose Life is it Anyway?	70
What is an Autonomous Decision?	71
<i>Voluntariness</i>	71
<i>Intentionality</i>	72

	<i>Effective Deliberation</i>	72
	<i>Authenticity</i>	76
	<i>Moral Reflection</i>	79
	Autonomy Requires Life	80
	Mill's Paradox in Defending Autonomy	81
	Occurrent and Dispositional Autonomy	82
	Autonomy as a Right	83
	HVL and Making an Autonomous Decision to Die	86
	Mill's Bridge Example	87
	Delaying a Decision	87
	Re-education or Coercion	88
	HVL vs An Autonomous Decision to Die	91
CHAPTER 5:	SLIPPERY SLOPES AND LIFE AND DEATH	95
	Slippery Slope Arguments	96
	<i>Sorites Slippery Slope Arguments</i>	96
	<i>Causal Slippery Slope Arguments</i>	97
	<i>Precedent Slippery Slope Arguments</i>	98
	<i>Combined Slippery Slope Arguments in Bioethical Debate</i>	99
	The Case of Nazi Germany	99
	Slippery Slopes and the Definition of Death	102
	Slippery Slopes at the End of Life	104
	Respect for the Dead and Slippery Slopes	105
	Respecting the Wishes of the Dead	106
	Slippery Slopes and the Sanctity of Life Doctrine	107
	A Slippery Slope Between Passive and Active Euthanasia?	109
	Legalising Euthanasia and Intolerable Circumstances	110
	<i>What Do We Mean By Bad Results?</i>	111
	Euthanasia and the Precedent Slippery Slope	113
	Euthanasia and the Causal Slippery Slope	114
	Boundaries to Slippery Slopes	115
	Slippery Slopes and Voluntary Euthanasia	116
	Autonomy and Slippery Slopes	118
	Conclusions	119
CHAPTER 6:	LIMITED RESOURCES LIMITING LIFE?	120
	Distribution of Resources	121
	Distributive Justice	121
	Libertarian Theories of Justice	122
	Utilitarian Theory and Distributive Justice	124
	<i>QALY's</i>	126
	<i>The Oregon Plan</i>	128
	<i>Triage</i>	130
	Egalitarian Theories and Resource Allocation	131
	Rawls's Theory of Justice	132

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

ix

	HVL and Health Distribution Policies	134
	HVL and Distributive Justice for Health Care	137
	Health Resource Allocation as a Constraint on HVL	138
	Should Clinicians Have a Dual Role?	139
	Conclusions	141
CHAPTER 7:	FUTURE ETHICS	143
	Intensive Care Ward Round	143
	<i>Bed 1</i>	143
	<i>Bed 2</i>	144
	<i>Bed 3</i>	144
	<i>Bed 4</i>	144
	<i>Bed 5</i>	144
	<i>Bed 6</i>	145
	<i>Beds 7-10</i>	145
	Case Studies and HVL Policy	146
	<i>Bed 1</i>	146
	<i>Bed 2</i>	146
	<i>Bed 3</i>	147
	<i>Bed 4</i>	147
	<i>Bed 5</i>	148
	<i>Bed 6</i>	149
	<i>Beds 7-10</i>	150
	Is Death Ever Preferable to Life?	150
ENDNOTES		152
INDEX		161



Since this work was based on a PhD thesis from the Centre for Human Bioethics at Monash University in Melbourne, I acknowledge with gratitude the contribution of my supervisor Professor Peter Singer who, although he largely defends a contrary position to many of the views expressed in this book ensured the rigour of the arguments put forward. I am grateful to the many staff and students at the Centre for discussions on the topics in this monograph over several years and to Neville Hicks of the Department of Community Medicine at the University of Adelaide for providing a supportive environment when I moved to Adelaide early in the project. I also was grateful for the opportunity to discuss the early chapters with Professor Renee Fox when she visited Adelaide. Since many of the examples that I use are clinical I acknowledge the value of the continuing education that I receive from my patients and colleagues. Sharing Jean Milne's experiences as a pastoral counsellor were particularly helpful in reflecting on patients' experiences at the end of life. Finally the commitment of time that such a project requires could only be given in the knowledge of the support of my family.